

Hung, Drawn and Quarterly 3:



**An analysis of Manchester City Council's progress against its climate emergency declaration and its climate action plan 2020-2025**

May 2020

## Contents

Acronyms.....	2
Summary .....	3
Recommendations .....	3
Structure.....	3
A. Timelines .....	4
B. Proposed savings and costings.....	5
C. Freedom of Information Acts requests .....	8
Key documents referred to in this report .....	12
Key upcoming dates .....	12
Thanks and about CEM .....	13

## Acronyms

<b>CEM</b>	Climate Emergency Manchester
<b>CCSG</b>	Climate Change Subgroup
<b>GMCA</b>	Greater Manchester Combined Authority
<b>GMPF</b>	Greater Manchester Pension Fund
<b>MCC</b>	Manchester City Council
<b>MCCP</b>	Manchester Climate Change Partnership
<b>NESC</b>	Neighbourhoods and Environment Scrutiny Committee
<b>ZCCG</b>	Zero Carbon Coordination Group

## Summary

Following the climate emergency declaration in July 2019 by Manchester City Council, Climate Emergency Manchester (CEM) decided to produce a quarterly report to offer independent assessment of the council's progress. This process involved submitting a set of Freedom of Information Act requests (FOIAs) that each related to one of the 23 elements stated in the climate emergency declaration. The [first report](#) was launched in October, along with an [accompanying set of proposals](#) generated by citizens. The [second report](#) launched in January 2020.

The third report appears in different and unprecedented circumstances. On Wednesday 11 March, the Executive approved the [Manchester City Council Action Plan 2020-2025](#). This document set out the actions required to achieve a 50% reduction in City Council direct CO2 emissions by 2025. It showed a greater vision than previous documents, but still lacked a pathway - that is to say, actions that demonstrate the route to net zero. It was also still not fully quantified and costed throughout. The need for **sequencing, prioritisation** of actions, **quantification** and **costing** have only become more important in the light of Covid-19.

This report engages with the present pressures and future challenges brought about by Covid-19. Firstly, its production used FOIAs even more selectively, to limit costs and the use of staff time as far as possible. Secondly, it notes the [MCC Covid-19 Forward Recovery Planning](#) document discussed at a virtual meeting of the Executive on 6 May and the present report should be read alongside the [briefing paper](#) on recovery produced by a coalition of Manchester campaign groups. The forward recovery planning document was silent on Manchester airport, amid reporting of a loan package from Greater Manchester's ten councils.

## Recommendations

- **Embed the Zero Carbon Coordination Group into recovery discussions**
- **Undertake further work on costings ahead of the June / July budget refresh**
- **Roll out policies due to be launched in April 2020 as soon as possible**
- **Engage citizens meaningfully in a time of social distancing**

## Structure

**A. Timelines** - This section compiles the various dates mentioned in the MCC Climate Action Plan and sets out the actions listed in chronological order.

**B. Proposed savings and costings** - This section lists the savings proposed in the MCC Climate Action Plan, indicating whether the funding needed for the saving has been calculated or is in place.

**C. Freedom of Information Act requests** - The report ends with a summary of the Freedom of Information Act requests submitted, and the responses received.

## A. Timelines

The purpose of this section is to highlight the need for **greater sequencing** and **prioritisation** of actions. Setting out the actions from the MCC Climate Action Plan Table of Actions in this ‘timeline’ format actions shows which measures have **already been delayed** and which look at **risk of delay**, as well as those which must be **incorporated into recovery planning**. It may be that there are some **quick wins** and good news announcements - strategies or policies signed off, or close to sign off, before the pandemic and which have the potential to be rolled out in the near future.

There is already precedent for some of the measures below taking place in the changed circumstances of Covid-19. The UK citizens’ assembly on climate has moved online, as have climate assemblies in France.

The timeline also indicates the number of actions in the plan listed only as ‘ongoing’ and the number which yet to have dates scheduled. This makes monitoring and evaluating progress difficult. Beyond 2020, much remains unclear. When a measure is listed in the plan as due for completion ‘by year xxxx’ the table records the latest possible instance. So an action marked as ‘by end 2020’ is recorded here as ‘Dec 2020’.

The table also classifies actions according to whether they are a form of **plan** or truly an **action**. Plans here encompasses strategies, policies, toolkits and training, as well as funding bids. Action means the implementation of the above.

Date	Measure	Classification
Early 2020	Business case to replace half of Biffa waste fleet with electric vehicles	Plan
Apr-20	A buildings and energy strategy	Plan
Apr-20	Start of Local Energy Plan for Manchester via GM Local Energy Market Project	Plan
Apr-20	A new Business Travel Policy for Council officers and elected members	Plan
Apr-20	Roll out of additional 10% social value weighting for the environment for procurement	Plan
Apr-20	Ward Plans complete, with programme for community engagement activities	Plan
Apr-20	City-wide communications strategy to share examples of projects, raise awareness	Plan
Apr-20	Sub Group of Work and Skills Board established to work up Green Skills Plan	Plan
Jun-20	Large scale event with city's schools to support action on climate change	Plan
Sep-20	Green Skills Plan drafted	Plan
Nov-20	Deliver a proposition to UK Government in relation to COP26	Plan
Dec-20	A Manchester build standard	Plan
Dec-20	Roll out of streetlight LED complete	Action
Dec-20	Act on the findings of Tyndall Centre to inform the specification of tenders for goods and services	Plan
Dec-20	A city-wide supplier toolkit focused on tackling climate change	Plan
Dec-20	1000 new trees, 1000 new hedgerows, 4 new community orchards	Action
Dec-20	Fund and commission a Tree Opportunity Mapping assessment	Plan
Dec-20	Underwritten post of Chief Executive for MCCA	Plan
Dec-20	A plan for engaging and supporting key Manchester stakeholders	Plan
Dec-20	Worked up plan for a zero carbon corridor along Oxford Road	Plan
Dec-20	Revised City Centre Transport Strategy with GM and Salford City Council	Plan
Dec-20	Carbon Literacy Programme rolled out	Plan

Dec-20	Become a Silver Carbon Literate Organisation	Plan
Dec-20	Carbon Literacy e-learning module rolled out	Plan
2021	Funding to replace half of Biffa waste fleet with electric vehicles	Plan
2021	First year of operation of Civic Quarter Heat Network	Action
2021	Stock condition survey of private rented sector complete	Plan
2023	Manchester Local Plan complete	Plan
2024	Single-use plastic free	Action
2025	Become a Gold Carbon Literate Organisation	Plan
Ongoing	Partnership work with UK Green Building Council and property developers.	Plan
Ongoing	Rolling replacement of Council's Operational Fleet with EV	Action
Ongoing	Strategic projects with GMCA around transport - EV buses, HS2, clean air zone	Action
Ongoing	Reduction in aviation emissions, lobby government to accelerate decarbonisation of air travel	Action
Ongoing	Incentives and support for staff to travel to work more sustainably	Action
Ongoing	Using other levers to reduce amount of single-use plastic	Action
Ongoing	Delivering priorities of Manchester Food Board	Action
Ongoing	Complete H2020 Green Grow project	Action
Ongoing	Embed zero carbon ambitions into all decision-making, including revenue and capital gateway	Plan
Ongoing	Influence GMPF	Plan
Ongoing	Learning from other cities (Covenant of Mayors, Eurocities, URBACT, C-Change)	Plan
TBC	Investment programme to deliver energy efficiency, retrofit, energy generation	Plan

## B. Proposed savings and costings

The [MCC Climate Action Plan Table of Actions](#) sets out two targets for the reduction of direct CO2 emissions during the period 2020-22025:

- Deliver at least a **50% reduction in direct carbon emissions** from their buildings, energy and transport by 2025 (from circa 30-32,000 tonnes in 2019/20 to circa 15-16,000 tonnes in 2024/25) via a 13% year on year reduction.
- **Report quarterly** on progress against actions and provide quantitative reports on data in tonnes of CO2

The plan below outlines the actions that will be undertaken to deliver this reduction and the amount each action will contribute to the overall reduction, including investment requirements:

<b>Direct Emissions Reduction Actions 2020-25</b>	<b>Annual Carbon Saving (TCO2)</b>	<b>Investment required/ Agreed</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Completion of Phase 1 Buildings Carbon Reduction Programme	1,400	£8.5m in place	Work expected completed by Mar 2021 Q4, with full savings commence 22-23
Completion of Phase 1 (a) Buildings Carbon Reduction Programme - ERDF Supported	400	Requires £2.9m (£1.7m MCC, £1.2m ERDF - decision May 20)	Work expected to be complete by Apr 2022
Phase 2 of Carbon Reduction Programme	3,000	Requires £30m (£15m agreed, £15m still to be identified)	Decide on buildings in scope May 20 Create designs and budgets Sep 20 Investment grade proposals Nov 20 Works begins Q4 20/21
Large scale energy generation scheme	7,000	Unknown	Business case by Dec 20
Completion of final year of the street lighting LED replacement programme	220	£38.2m in place	Final saving expected for 20/21
Estimated carbon emissions saving benefit from the decarbonisation of National Grid	800	Unknown	No further information
Completion of the Civic Quarter Heat Network and connection to the Town Hall, Town Hall Extension, Art Gallery and Central Library	1,600	£26m in place	Savings expected to commence in 20/21
Replacement of half of waste fleet vehicles with Electric Vehicles	900	Unknown	A business case has been submitted but funding not yet identified. Assumes a 9KtCO2 saving over a 10 year period
Reductions to the Council's Fleet through increase in number of Electric Vehicles	400	Unknown	Savings are based on an approximately 45% CO2 saving over 5 years between 1 <sup>st</sup> Apr 2020 and 31 <sup>st</sup> Mar 2025
Reduction in staff travel via car, taxi, air, train	100	Unknown	No further information
<b>Total Estimated Savings</b>	<b>15,820</b>		

Following clarifications from FOIAs submitted to the Council, the table below shows when reductions will be realised. Where text is in red, funding or scope are still to be agreed before the project can progress or information has not been provided:

Action	Reduction in year (TCO2)				
	20/21	21/22	22/23	23/24	24/25
Reduction Phase 1		700	1436	1436	1436
Reduction Phase 1a			415	415	415
Reduction Phase 2			3000	3000	3000
Large scale energy					7000
LED Lights	220	220	220	220	220
Civic Quarter Network	1600	1600	1600	1600	1600
Waste Fleet	900	900	900	900	900
Council Fleet					400
Travel					100
National Grid Reductions					800
<b>Total Reduction</b>	<b>2720</b>	<b>3420</b>	<b>7571</b>	<b>7571</b>	<b>15871</b>
<b>Original</b>	<b>37418</b>	<b>37418</b>	<b>37418</b>	<b>37418</b>	<b>37418</b>
<b>New</b>	<b>34698</b>	<b>33998</b>	<b>29847</b>	<b>29847</b>	<b>21547</b>
<b>Percentage reduction</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>9%</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>42%</b>

Based on the proposed actions, even if all the savings are realised, this will only equate to an overall 42% reduction by April 2025 and will certainly not achieve a 13% year on year reduction. Additionally, there is a **substantial funding gap** with business cases still to be approved and sources of funding still to be identified.

The first quarterly progress report from the City Council is due at the beginning of June and we look forward to seeing further details at that time.

## C. Freedom of Information Acts requests

MCC Climate Action Plan - Action Table	Question	Response	Comments
<p>1.1 - Complete Phase 1 and Phase 1 (a) of the Carbon Reduction Plan and secure funding and delivery mechanism for future phases which will run from 2020-25.</p>	<p><b>Please provide the information setting out how the amounts were calculated for Phase 1a.</b></p> <p><b>Please provide any documentation which shows how you calculated the savings of 300TcO2 for Phase 2.</b></p> <p><b>Please provide any minutes of meetings which discuss the delivery, timescales or funding or timescales for Phase 3</b></p>	<p>Phase 1a) involves Solar PV installations at two buildings:</p> <p>The National Cycling Centre (240TcO2). This is forecast to be a 19 month project from the point at which funding is approved through to fully commissioned Solar PV CarPort Array. Funding is expected to be approved in May 2020 leading to an estimated completion date of December 2021. Please note: Covid-19 could impact the start date of this project as procurement will involve site visits.</p> <p>Hammerstone Road Depot (160tCO2). This is forecast to be a 17 month project from start to finish, the project has a dependency on the planned wider refurbishment of the roof, this must be complete before Solar PV can be installed. The programme estimates it will be able to access the refurbished roof to begin the installation from December 2021 and complete by April 2022.</p> <p>The 3,000tCO<sub>2</sub> saving is a target (rather than a calculation) and is based on learning from the 1st phase of delivery about what can be achieved within the period covered by the plan.</p> <p>Focus to date has been on delivering Phase 1 and mobilising to deliver Phase 1 (a) and Phase 2. Phase 3 will be considered in more detail at the earliest opportunity. There are not currently any minutes or meetings that capture discussion around this point.</p>	<p>Given the phased nature of this scheme, and the dependency of each phase on the preceding, this needs monitoring. It is recommended that this features in each quarterly report.</p>
<p>1.4 - A feasibility and business case for a large scale energy generation scheme from large scale Solar PV and Onshore and Offshore Wind on Council land and</p>	<p><b>Please provide any documentation created to secure the mandate to continue to the business case.</b></p>	<p>The Council has publicly committed to this project and it is included in the final version of the Climate Change Action Plan 2020-25. The project has been discussed at the Zero Carbon Coordination Group and is currently part of the Investment and Delivery Workstream. Council officers have had internal discussions regarding how best to progress the project and revenue</p>	<p>This demonstrates that the Zero Carbon Coordination Group must be embedded into recovery planning. If not, there is a risk that its</p>



buildings, or sites in third party ownership. This will include an assessment of the different business models available in terms of capital cost, commercial risk and speed of deliverability.		<p>funding has been committed to fund the feasibility study.</p> <p>Discussions with Warrington Borough Council and other stakeholders who have delivered similar schemes have been initiated but are currently being paused due to the COVID-19 pandemic.</p>	<p>previous discussions do not join up with new plans.</p> <p>Sharing best practice and learning from other councils is welcome.</p>
1.5 - Complete roll out of Street lighting LED replacement and investigate ways to further reduce consumption and improve efficiency	<b>Since 1st September 2019 and up until 14th March 2020, what work has been undertaken to investigate further ways to reduce energy consumption and improve efficiency apart from street light LED replacement?</b>	The Council has considered the capabilities of the CMS system that controls the LED lighting to make further energy saving through dimming the lights at certain times. Obviously this action would bring other significant challenges and impacts such as health and safety. This is currently being considered by officers and elected members but has been put on hold due to the prioritisation of the Council's response to COVID-19.	Although we understand that there may now be challenges due to Covid-19, this suggests that little work happened over the spring and winter before any lockdown measures came into place.
1.6 - Complete the Civic Quarter Heat Network (CQHN) and connect to all buildings including the Town Hall in 2023/24	<b>There appears to be some double counting of savings between the Civic Quarter Heat Network project and Phase 1 of the Carbon Reduction Plan (e.g. Town Hall Extension and Central Library). Please provide the documentation that lays out the breakdown of savings for each scheme to demonstrate that this is not the case.</b>	Phase 1 of the Buildings Carbon Reduction Programme includes work we are doing on LED Lighting and Lighting Controls in the Town Hall Extension but no works in the Town Hall or Central Library. Works in the Town Hall Extension are expected to save 169 tCO2 per annum from reduced electricity consumption. These are separate to the savings generated via the Civic Quarter Heat Network.	This response is incorporated into section 2 of the report, above.
1.8 - Deliver a comprehensive investment programme to deliver energy efficiency, retrofit and energy generation from solar panels and heat pumps across all of the Council owned properties managed by	<b>Since September 1st 2019 and up until 14 March 2020 what new policies / schemes / grants have been made available to help Mancunians retrofit homes they own or rent?</b>	There have been no new policies / schemes / grants within this period.	This is disappointing, particularly given that Andy Burnham has highlighted the importance of retrofit to the recovery.

Northwards Housing and other contractors.			
1.11 - Zero carbon commitments are taken into account when any Council owned buildings or land is disposed of or leased to a third party.	<b>Between 1st September 2019 and 14th March 2020, please provide evidence of all instances in which zero carbon commitments have been taken into account when any Council owned buildings or land has been either disposed of or leased to a third party?</b>	Due to Covid-19 we are currently unable to answer this questions. Any information held would be contained within case files for the commercial and other disposals. These are stored in the Town Hall Extension or on off- site storage which cannot be accessed at this time.	The MCC Covid-19 Forward Recovery Planning document states:  7.3.2 The work will include (not in priority order):  a) Improved management of data - ensuring there are clear policies for handling, storing and archiving data (including documents and emails) with the appropriate security in place. This is even more important for an organisation that is predominantly working remotely
2.1 - Develop business case and funding to replace half the Biffa waste and recycling fleet with Electric Vehicles by 2025	<b>Please provide minutes or documentation which set out the selection of 2025 as the target date for half of the fleet to become EV, as well as how the saving of 900tCO2 was calculated.</b>	Extracts from a document from MCC to the Energy Savings Trust included and incorporated into section 2 of this report (above).	The response provided further information on the savings, but not on the reasons for only half of the fleet to become electric and for the target for this to be five years away.
2.7 – Review and act on the findings of the Tyndall Centre for Climate Research to assess how emissions from Manchester Airport can be managed in line with the Paris Agreement. Work with Manchester Airport Group and other local authorities with	<b>Please provide any documentation showing details of meetings or reports scheduled to enable the setting of targets and a plan for emission reduction from Manchester Airport? Can you provide any documentation that sets out at which point in the year annual airport</b>	The Manchester Airport Group have set out their zero carbon plans and further information can be found at the link below: <a href="https://www.magairports.com/responsible-business/zero-carbon-airports/">https://www.magairports.com/responsible-business/zero-carbon-airports/</a>  As per the recent updates to Neighbourhoods and Environment Scrutiny Committee and Executive in March 2020, an invitation is to be extended to Manchester Airport Group to join the Manchester Climate Change Partnership to progress the objective contained within the Manchester City Council Climate Change Action Plan. Any requests for documentation regarding dividends to shareholders would	Scrutiny of the airport will be key given the reported loan from the ten GM councils.  Greater transparency is needed around revenue estimates from MAG, emissions calculations and the processes by which the dividend

<p>airports within their boundaries to lobby the government to accelerate the decarbonisation of air travel."</p>	<p><b>emissions are calculated and what criteria and process are used to calculate the dividends paid back to the shareholders?</b></p>	<p>need to be submitted to Manchester Airport Group.</p>	<p>is paid back to shareholders.</p>
<p>2.8 – Deliver incentives and support for Council staff to commute to work more sustainably including salary sacrifice schemes for bus, rail and tram; cycle to work scheme; provision of cycling facilities</p>	<p><b>Between 1st September 2019 and 14th March 2020, what actions have been taken to encourage staff and elected members on council business to walk or cycle instead of taking taxis?</b></p>	<p>This is not something we routinely count.</p>	<p>A dashboard or a section in quarterly report which indicated how many staff had e.g. taken up the cycle to work scheme would help the Council show that it was leading the way and would be of interest for residents who are reconsidering their transport options in light of Covid-19.</p>
<p>5.4 – Deliver ward Plans by April 2020.</p>	<p><b>Since 1st September 2019 and 14th March 2020, how many ward meetings have been held as part of the Our Manchester strategy to 'identify residents and partners who want to be actively involved in achieving the zero carbon target'? Please provide the dates of any meetings held.</b></p>	<p>No response received on this point.</p>	<p>Any plan benefits from engaging with people who know the area affected. Many, such as Professor Donna Hall, have argued that the <a href="#">snubbing of local expertise</a> has hampered the response to Covid-19. A response to the climate crisis must work with communities. The neighborhood by neighborhood planning of Walk Ride Groups in response to social distancing measures offers one example</p>

## Key documents referred to in this report

- [Manchester City Council Climate Action Plan 2020-2025](#)
- [Manchester City Council Climate Action Plan Appendix 1, Table of Actions](#)
- [Manchester City Council Climate Change Agency Framework](#)
- [Manchester City Council Covid-19 Forward Recovery Planning, May 2020](#)
- [Campaigners’ briefing note on Manchester City Council Covid-19 Forward Recovery Planning, May 2020](#)
- [GMCA 5 year Environment Plan for Greater Manchester](#)

## Key upcoming dates

Date	Event
20 May 2020	CANCELLED Full Council – <i>Now November 2020</i>
27 May 2020	CANCELLED Neighbourhoods and Environment Scrutiny Committee
27 May 2020	CEM ‘People’s Scrutiny Committee’ – 7pm. More details soon.
03 June 2020	2pm – Executive
24 June 2020	CANCELLED Neighbourhoods and Environment Scrutiny Committee
June / July	Budget refresh

## Thanks and about CEM

### **Thanks**

Thanks to the Council officers who dealt with these Freedom of Information Act requests, particularly in such difficult circumstances.

Thanks in advance to all those citizens of Manchester who lobby their councillors on the basis of having read this report.

### **Climate Emergency Manchester**

Established in March 2019, CEM is a voluntary, non-partisan group which exists to examine the performance of Manchester City Council on its climate (and other environmental) policies. It also seeks to provide examples of 'best practice' from other local authorities, and to make it easier for citizens of Manchester to understand how the Council operates, and how they can have an influence.

[www.climateemergencymanchester.net](http://www.climateemergencymanchester.net)

[contact@climateemergencymanchester.net](mailto:contact@climateemergencymanchester.net)